

ACCOUNTABILITY AND TRANSPARENCY REVIEW TEAM
F2F Meeting Beijing – 30 August
CHAT TRANSCRIPT

Kieren McCarthy:The sound is very quiet at my end from whoever is on the phone at the moment

Kieren McCarthy:Multiple voices now

CLO:still an Issue Kieren ?

Kieren McCarthy:Looped sound now - 10 second delay repeated over the top

CLO:I'll get Alice rto follow up

Kieren McCarthy:Hang on... may have it

CLO:Being looked into now

Kieren McCarthy:Ah okay - you starte streaming through Adobe

ICANN Presenter:Kieren, do you have both the stream and Adobe Connect open?

Kieren McCarthy:Sorry - you've not streamed through Adobe previously

ICANN Presenter:Yes, that's a new feature for this meeting. Please close one of them or mute the adobe feed.

Kieren McCarthy:Yes, already done

Robin Gross:person on the phone? is inaudible - the female voice

Kieren McCarthy:But it is still very quiet - presumably remote and calling in?

CLO:Yes correct that is Berkman phoniung into us here so via speaker to the room

Kieren McCarthy:Ah. Always difficult

ICANN Presenter:Due to bandwidth issues, we've had to rearrange things. The phone call will be better on the Adobe portion shortly but should be fine on the mp3 stream.

Kieren McCarthy:ok, will try the MP3

Kieren McCarthy:Is is possible to publicly discuss the reasons that the ATRT cannot discuss dot-xxx? Or is it important to keep the concerns confidential as well?

Kieren McCarthy:Will the letter be made available?

Robin Gross:who is speaking?

Alice Jansen:Brian Cute - the ATRT Chair

Kieren McCarthy:Ok thanks Brian

Robin Gross:thanks, Alice

Jim Prendergast:when brian muted his mic, we lost berkman feed

Robin Gross:audio is gone

ICANN Presenter:We're working on getting the phone call into adobe connect. It is currently available in the MP3 stream.

Robin Gross:I am not able to receive audio in either adobe or te mp3 stream.

Jim Prendergast:same here

ICANN Presenter:We're looking into it.

Kieren McCarthy:No sound for me either

Robin Gross:is anyone receiving audio via the web?

ICANN Presenter:I've turned on the microphone on a laptop while the audio engineers are working on the issue.

Kieren McCarthy:thanks Alice
Kieren McCarthy:I have sound now - not bad
Kieren McCarthy:(not good but not bad)
ICANN Presenter:Once a break occurs, we will be reconnecting the audio for the phone call.
Kieren McCarthy:I know you probably already know this but just in case - sound very weak from Berkman person
ICANN Presenter:We're sorry about the quality - the audio engineer is currently making a new cable.
Kieren McCarthy:Much stronger sound
chiao:can the chair ask the presenter to speak a bit slowly?
chiao:can not hear quite well because of the sound quality
Brian Cute:how is the sound?
chiao:thanks Brian its good
Robin Gross:better, thanks
Louie Lee:I'm online. Thanks, Brian.
Robin Gross:audio gone again
Rafik:no sound?
ICANN Presenter:The phone call audio is only available via the MP3 stream at this time.
ICANN Presenter:<http://stream.icann.org:8000/atrt.m3u>
Robin Gross:thanks
Rafik:who is the presneter?
Brian Cute:Caroline Nolan from the Berkman Center.
CLO:The Paper under discussion from WG#1 is now in this room thanks it will also be placed in the relevant online records for the WG & the ATRT
Alice Jansen:Apologies for the delay - the document is now in the Adobe room
James Bladel:Can you recap the last 3-5 min of Fabio's point?
CLO 2:aThe fear expressed by some that the ICANN Board is 'influenced' by staff and without judgement on if this is a fear or a fact then, he also reminded us of the way the EU Commissioners have dealt with this
James Bladel:Thanks CLO
Robin Gross:is this doc downloadable?
CLO:These are working docs for discussion I suspect all WG's will produce 'fresh ones' as a result of today and tomorrows deliberations...
Louie Lee:Alice, CLO is slightly muffled over the teleconference. Can anything be done to improve that?
James Bladel:I agree. Perhaps she could slow down a bit?
James Bladel:Her words are running together due to audio quality.
Alice Jansen:Thanks Louie and James for the feedback - Cory is looking into it
Louie Lee:.)
James Bladel:Too much bass. Need more treble. :)
Louie Lee:The doc for WG#3 was distributed via our mail list. Archived and linked:
<http://mm.icann.org/pipermail/at-review/2010-August/000667.html>
Louie Lee:For WG#4: <http://mm.icann.org/pipermail/at-review/2010-August/000668.html>

Louie Lee:Other docs: <http://mm.icann.org/pipermail/at-review/2010-August/000664.html> and amended: <http://mm.icann.org/pipermail/at-review/2010-August/000665.html>

James Bladel:alice: beijing is very muffled (all speakers) I can hear other callers just fine, though.

Louie Lee:agreed

Cory Schruth:James: Are you on the telephone bridge or listening to a stream?

Louie Lee:maybe beijing can dial back in?

James Bladel:telephone bridge

Louie Lee:just got worse :(

James Bladel:all I hear are vibrating speakers. :)

Louie Lee:the stream is a lot better

James Bladel:yes.

Cory Schruth:Is the phone call any better?

James Bladel:phone went quiet

Warren Adelman:Just lost China

Cory Schruth:Standby

James Bladel:stream still live

Warren Adelman:It is back. Thanks

Cory Schruth:Is the quality better? We may have had a bad line.

Louie Lee:still bad

James Bladel:I have two headsets: phone in left ear, adobe in right ear

Louie Lee:warren, you'll want to turn on your stream while Cory redials

James Bladel:Ok, excellent.

Louie Lee:yup

Warren Adelman:stream is way better

CLO:Warren & Louie as were wrapping up WG#3 now do you have any points or comments to make ?

Louie Lee:I'm good. Thx, Cheryl.

Louie Lee:I'd only be repeating that it's good to include what's working well and improved.

CLO:Noted

Warren Adelman:we need to regroup as a WG as to the best of my recollection we have not had a separate call.

Warren Adelman:Can we call on any of the ALAC community to assist with the transcript review

Louie Lee:wg#4 paper: <http://mm.icann.org/pipermail/at-review/2010-August/000668.html>

CLO:@Warren yes ALAC and At-Large would be delighted to assist

CLO:BUT it will effect their bandwidth as well so something when we use volunteers "has to give"

Louie Lee:my addition so far would be that for ombudsman data, we'd want to do our statistical analysis on "actionable issues" separately from issues that are outside the ombudsman's scope.

CLO:There would also be some question of bias I guess as well

CLO:Re the Ombudsman's metrics his reports have some information but onky to a point his reports still needs action / actionaing etc.,

Kieren McCarthy:I think what Chris is trying to say is: stop talking in pseudo-sociological language and focus on what the problems are and come up with solutions to them

CLO:Now the Doc is up FYI were on page 52 of the doc

CLO:we will be working in reverse back through it ;-)

Robin Gross 2:thanks, having the doc up is helpful.

Kieren McCarthy:The main problem with taking a pure academic approach is that no one has enough time to do it; or to interpret it; or to draw out useful recommendations from it

Kieren McCarthy:Also the academic approach only works when the academics are *not* a part of the process itself

Kieren McCarthy:In this case you need evaluators who will tell you what has happened and why, and then allow others to make sense of it and make recommendations to improve it

Louie Lee:doc: <http://mm.icann.org/pipermail/at-review/attachments/20100829/e37c6793/attachment-0001.pdf>

Louie Lee:did everyone else have the stream audio cut out on them?

Louie Lee:(could be just me)

CLO:Now looking at page 5

CLO:remembering these are Questions for staff!

CLO:Chris is pointing out that staff should be given Q&A on issue of fact not opinion (to paraphrase)

Kieren McCarthy:I agree 100 percent with Peter - to be considered in an accountability and transparency review, you should be prepared to be open about who you are, and what your views are

Robin Gross 2:+1

Kieren McCarthy:The problem is that the ATRT team have already strayed from this open approach

Kieren McCarthy:I also agree with Chris that there is no point asking staff questions that they are not going to be answer openly

Kieren McCarthy:able to answer

Kieren McCarthy:To ask questions that staff cannot answer openly - and you would not wish them to answer them openly because the staff job cuts both ways - is to put ICANN staff in an unnecessarily difficult position

Kieren McCarthy:And I say this from a position of believing that, yes, ICANN staff needs *more* review and has too much unchecked influence in the process

Kieren McCarthy:The problem is that the questionnaires appear to be seeking out problems in order to highlight them - rather than focus on finding ways to identify patterns of problems and work *together* to improve them

Kieren McCarthy:In defence of Berkman - they have had a ridiculously short period of time to turn around the review of a very complex organization - and are now being picked apart by people that have lived and breathed ICANN for ten years

Kieren McCarthy:My opinion for what its worth - and having been through two previous studies into ICANN's accountability and transparency - the ATRT is already six months behind. You can either reduce your scope and be effective on a certain area; or expand the amount of time you give yourselves; or recognise that you will end up producing recommendations that are either too vague or insufficiently supported

Wolfgang:Quality of the end result os more important than meeting a dateline.

CLO:!5 min break now

Louie Lee:sorry, my phone likes to go off-mute on its own. Using the teleconference *6 from now on.

CLO:We don't need the Berkman paper up now

CLO:perhaps a notes or discussion space to capture outcomes might be of use

James Bladel:Can we get Fabio's principals visible online?

CLO:Alice can you retype the few words on the screen here into the Adobe room for Warren & Louie to see please

CLO:Thanks Alice

James Bladel:Process, Environment and what are we calling the 3rd?

Alice Jansen:You are very welcome

Wolfgang:Payment of directors is an issue what we experienced in the outreach phase of the 2010 NomCom. The risk is that you exclude a substantial number of qualified people who can not afford to work one week per month without compensation. As I said in the Brussels ICANN meeting, we have to be careful to avoid a situation where the ICANN Board becomes a group of old rich men/women who have time and resources and enjoy to do the job.

James Bladel 2:This thread is very difficult to follow via audio only....

James Bladel 2:but many thanks to Alice for trying to keep up with Adobe.

Louie Lee:Yup.

Alice Jansen:You're welcome :)

Louie Lee:I'll agree to jump in as necessary. :)

James Bladel 2:ouch

Louie Lee:I'm moving to another room

James Bladel 2:Sun is coming up soon...

CLO:Hey James "welcome to my world ;-)" remember all those VI calls ;-)

James Bladel 2:it's only fair. The clock hates us all!

James Bladel 2:Not on audio

James Bladel 2:But I will capture. Go ahead and volunteer me. :)

James Bladel 2:I can hear, but not speak.

James Bladel 2:Yes.

CLO: Louie can you try for the same in WG#3 :?

James Bladel 2:Can we have a rubric of "Larry's Template" ?

CLO:i.e. => Would ICANN <Insert from our key purpose here> be improved by:- <insert options here> from WG## docs

Alice Jansen:I have asked Manal to forward Larry's template to me - will share it with you as soon as received ;)

James Bladel 2:Thank you Alice. Will look at it after I've slept some.

Louie Lee:(just rejoined on adobe connect. browser crashed)

Alice Jansen:and with you Louie if applicable

Alice Jansen:and with you Louie if applicable

James Bladel 2:Closed session tomorrow am.

James Bladel 2:Time change?

Louie Lee:8 am start with closed session

James Bladel 2:Lovely. ;)

Louie Lee:2 pm for me :)

CLO:OK all that is it for today Open session starts tomorrow at 0000 (midnight UTC) 0900 local time

Alice Jansen:Thanks for joining -

Louie Lee:Thank you!